

## University of Tasmania Open Access Repository

### Cover sheet

**Title**

Science narratives : the construction, mobilisation and validation of Hydro Tasmania's case for Basslink.

**Author**

Duncan, R

**Bibliographic citation**

Duncan, R (2004). Science narratives : the construction, mobilisation and validation of Hydro Tasmania's case for Basslink.. University Of Tasmania. Thesis. <https://doi.org/10.25959/23211953.v1>

Is published in:

**Copyright information**

This version of work is made accessible in the repository with the permission of the copyright holder/s under the following,

**Licence.**

If you believe that this work infringes copyright, please email details to: [oa.repository@utas.edu.au](mailto:oa.repository@utas.edu.au)

Downloaded from University of Tasmania Open Access Repository

Please do not remove this coversheet as it contains citation and copyright information.

University of Tasmania Open Access Repository

Library and Cultural Collections

University of Tasmania

Private Bag 3

Hobart, TAS 7005 Australia

E [oa.repository@utas.edu.au](mailto:oa.repository@utas.edu.au)

CRICOS Provider Code 00586B | ABN 30 764 374 782

[utas.edu.au](http://utas.edu.au)

**SCIENCE NARRATIVES:  
THE CONSTRUCTION, MOBILISATION AND VALIDATION OF  
HYDRO TASMANIA'S CASE FOR BASSLINK**

**By**

**RONLYN DUNCAN  
BSc., BA (Hons) (UNSW)**

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy,  
Centre for Environmental Studies, Department of Geography and Environmental  
Studies, University of Tasmania  
(April 2004)

This thesis contains no material that has been accepted for the award of any other higher degree or graduate diploma in any tertiary institution. To the best of my knowledge and belief, the thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person, except when due reference is made in the text of the thesis.

.....  
Ronlyn Duncan

This thesis may be made available for loan and limited copying in accordance with the *Copyright Act 1968*.

.....  
Ronlyn Duncan

## ABSTRACT

---

The central focus of this thesis is the role of narratives in the construction, mobilisation and validation of scientific knowledge claims. With an epistemological commitment to constructivism, which conceptualises scientific knowledge as the product of a process (and not something revealed), the regulatory domain of impact assessment in respect of Basslink, a 350 kilometre power cable that will link Tasmania to the Australian mainland across Bass Strait, has been used as a case study to undertake the task of tracing the translations that intervened between assessment process inputs and outputs – contributions deemed ‘scientific’ and ‘independent’ by the project’s proponents and supporters. Specifically, the knowledge claims tendered by Hydro Tasmania, Tasmania’s hydro-electricity generator, in respect of predicted environmental impacts on the Gordon River arising from changes to river flows required to generate and export hydro-electricity across Basslink, have been examined. The central epistemological question has been how, given the extent of the contingencies and indeterminacies in predictive economic and environmental modelling inputs and outputs used to substantiate the impacts and benefits of Basslink (which have been detailed in the thesis), was Hydro Tasmania’s case in support of the development made durable and, thereby, legitimated by the decision-making body charged with the task of assessing the project. This study follows Hydro Tasmania’s knowledge claims in respect of the Gordon River impacts through the process and demonstrates the pivotal role of narratives and the extent to which they can bridge empirical gaps, explain and obscure inconsistencies, erase unexpected model outputs, contextualise findings and mobilise ontological claims. The tension between the fulfilment of disclosure

requirements upon proponents by means of 'scientific facts' and the extent to which issues such as trust, accountability and past track record, bear upon people's uptake of these 'facts' is also examined in this work.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

---

There are, of course, many people to acknowledge for their valuable contributions in helping to bring this project to completion. In the first instance, though, my move from Sydney to Hobart and this work would not have been possible without the Australian Postgraduate Award. For this, I am especially grateful.

From within the Centre for Environmental Studies, I'd like to thank my supervisor, Peter Hay, for his intuition and understanding of what must have appeared, at times, to be a student going round-and-round in circles. For enriching my academic experience and for caring so much, I'd like to give thanks to Elaine Stratford. Thank you, too, to John Todd for his archival treasures. I must also mention two friends and colleagues. First, Andrew Harwood, whose questioning of my theoretical ideas prompted considerable reflection. Although I came back to my starting point, it was well worth the trip. Second, Colin Winkler, who was always so generous with his time, particularly on computer matters. I would also like to acknowledge the many other wonderful friends I have made during my time at the Centre, particularly Denbeigh, Julie, Elizabeth, Peat, James, Greg, Jo, Dave, Emma, Kete and Mary, without whom my time there would have been greatly diminished.

Having had access to the tape recordings of the Basslink hearings taken by the Resource Planning and Development Commission was vital for the project. In this respect, I'd like to thank the Executive Commissioner, Julian Green, as well as the staff of the RPDC who always managed to find a place for me to do my work. I enjoyed, very much, the conversations that took place with the people from the RPDC who wandered past my door.

I'd also like to thank Steven Halliday, Michael Connarty and Helen Locher from Hydro Tasmania for their prompt attention to my queries. The wealth of information provided by Ralph Mitchell from the Tasmanian Fishing Industry Council and Dagmar Nordberg on marine issues was also very much appreciated. I am also grateful to the many people with whom I came in contact at the public hearings, who provided information or answered queries, especially David Jeffrey, Peter Davies, Bruce Davis, Stuart Morris, Margaret Blakers, Helen Gee and Michael Kirlew.

There were so many others that I called on for assistance and who gave it gladly; among them were, Alan Pears, Bill Dockrill, Taylor Bildstein, Daniel Cooper, Andrew

Durran, Andrea Bunting, Gavan McDonell, Ben Northcott, Gabrielle Kuiper, David Miller and Hugh Outhred.

Last, but not least, I'd like to thank my partner, Arthur, who has had to endure what accompanies a research project such as this, and our daughter, Laina, who has had to tolerate some absences in the first months of her life.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

FIGURES .....	13
GLOSSARY OF TERMS .....	14
<b>INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>17</b>
Thesis Structure .....	20
<b>Chapter 1</b>	
<b>THE BASSLINK PROJECT, ASSESSMENT PROCESS BOUNDARIES</b>	
<b>AND ISSUES OUT OF REACH.....</b>	<b>26</b>
THE BASSLINK PROJECT.....	27
Rationale and Goals of Basslink.....	27
Legislative Context.....	30
A Project of State and National Significance .....	32
Tasmania's Resource Planning and Development Commission.....	33
Joint Advisory Panel.....	34
Process Structure .....	35
Praise for the Process .....	36
DIIAS Critique .....	37
Merits of the Process.....	38
PROJECT AND PROCESS BOUNDARIES.....	39
Tracing the Limits .....	39
Basslink Development Steering Committee.....	39
Basslink Development Board .....	41
Close Ties.....	43
Draft Scope Guidelines.....	46
PROJECT FINANCES AND MODELLING ISSUES .....	47
Commercial Arrangements.....	47
Finances of Hydro Tasmania and the State of Tasmania .....	49
Fiscal Evidence .....	50
Indicative Figures.....	52
Changing the Cable Technology on Environmental Grounds .....	54
Hydro Tasmania's Cost Limitations.....	62
Project Cost Hike .....	64
<b>Chapter 2</b>	
<b>A HYDRO PAST BUT A RENEWABLES FUTURE .....</b>	<b>70</b>
THE TRANSFORMATION OF THE HYDRO-ELECTRIC COMMISSION .....	70
Hydro-industrialisation.....	70
Load and Demand Forecasts .....	71
Effects of Hydro-industrialisation .....	72
Consumer Pain and Confusion in the 1980s.....	75
Retaining Expertise and Skills.....	77

Cultural and Fiscal Change .....	77
Past Basslink Proposals .....	79
Basslink in the 1990s .....	81
A New Future for the Hydro-Electric Commission .....	82
Selling the Public Asset .....	84
Bacon Government's Energy Policy .....	85
No Threat from Debt .....	86
Talking Up the Tasmanian Economy .....	90
Hydro Tasmania's Solutions to the World .....	92
Environmental Credentials.....	94
A Renewables Future.....	94
Mandatory Renewable Energy Targets.....	95
Ambitious Wind Power Plans.....	97
Dampening Wind Power Claims .....	99
Hydro Tasmania's Economic Imperatives.....	100
THE GREENS' PERSPECTIVE AND THEIR DILEMMA.....	102
Geographical Links to Basslink.....	102
Political Links to Basslink .....	103
Response to the DIAS.....	104
Raising the Broader Issues .....	105
Overpowering Tasmania.....	106
Problems with the Mandatory Renewable Energy Target .....	107
Mandatory Renewable Energy Target Baselines.....	108
Mandatory Renewable Energy Target Review .....	111
Climate Change .....	112
People's Hearts and Minds.....	115
Evocative Imagery.....	116
The Contradiction .....	119
Linking Basslink with Wind Power.....	120
<b>Chapter 3</b>	
<b>THEORETICAL CONTEXT AND METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK.....</b>	<b>123</b>
THEORETICAL CONTEXT .....	123
Epistemology .....	124
Realism .....	124
Constructivism .....	125
Boundary-Defining Language.....	127
Conditional Knowledge .....	127
Conditionality as Indeterminacy .....	130
Contextual Factors .....	132
Inverting 'Reality' .....	133
Constructing Facts, Obscuring Conditionality .....	133
Moving Modalities .....	134
Constructing 'Reality' .....	135
Modality-Shedding Devices .....	136
STS THEORETICAL DISPUTES AND CONCEPTUAL TOOLS.....	137
Science Wars .....	137
Relativism.....	138
Realists and Constructivists.....	139



Ontology .....	140
Social Realism, Finitism and Interests .....	142
Co-construction .....	144
Certainty Trough.....	146
ANALYTICAL FOCUS.....	149
A Constructivist Epistemology .....	149
Links with Environmental Impact Assessment Theory and Practice .....	150
Predictive Models.....	152
Adaptive Management.....	153
Preventive Paradigm .....	154
Fiducial Science .....	154
Dispensing with Objectivity .....	156
METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK .....	157
Discourse Analysis Literature Review .....	157
Discourse as Action.....	158
Ethnomethodology and its Origins .....	159
A Foucauldian Approach.....	161
Discursive Practice – Discourses-in-Practice.....	162
Fairclough’s Critical Language Study .....	163
Ideology and Hegemony.....	164
Conceptual Interpretative Repertoires.....	166
Narrative Analysis .....	169
Narratives Travel .....	171
Central Questions.....	173
RESEARCH DESIGN .....	174
Case Study and Theory Testing Approach.....	174
Empirical Resources.....	175
 <b>Chapter 4</b>	
<b>TWO CASES FROM HYDRO TASMANIA IN SUPPORT OF BASSLINK .....</b>	<b>177</b>
Conceptual Distinctions.....	178
Call for Science.....	179
Benefits of Basslink for the Gordon River .....	180
With and Without Basslink Baselines.....	183
Two Cases for Basslink .....	184
Operational Changes on the Gordon River from Basslink.....	185
Discharge Zones on the River Banks .....	186
Environmental Impacts of Case 1.....	187
Environmental Impacts of Case 2.....	190
Mitigation Measures .....	191
Conditions on Mitigation .....	193
Modelling Mitigation Effects .....	202
A New Without Basslink Baseline .....	206
 <b>Chapter 5</b>	
<b>IDENTIFYING CONTINGENCIES IN</b>	
<b>PREDICTIVE MODELLING AND PROJECTED BASELINES .....</b>	<b>207</b>
The Truth About Basslink .....	207
Past Studies.....	208

Hydro Tasmania's Scientific Studies .....	208
A Crucial Conditionality .....	209
Multiple Uses of TEMSIM.....	209
TEMSIM Origins.....	212
TEMSIM Structure and Performance.....	213
Inputs and Outputs of TEMSIM.....	214
Disclosure of TEMSIM Model Assumptions, Limitations and Uncertainties.....	215
Sensitivity Analyses of Basslink Drivers.....	216
Victorian Prices .....	217
National Electricity Market.....	219
Reduced Wholesale Electricity Prices.....	219
PROPHET Simulation Model .....	220
PROPHET Price Scenarios.....	222
PROPHET Knowledge Connections.....	223
PROPHET Inputs.....	226
Repeating the Past in the Future .....	227
Strategic Bidding Strategies .....	228
Modelling Behaviour .....	229
Future Changes for a Market Environment.....	230
PROPHET Core.....	231
Knowledge Distances.....	233
Tasmanian Hydro-generation Load.....	233
Load Sensitivity Analyses .....	234
Changes in Tasmanian Load.....	236
Natural Gas .....	237
Loss of a Major Industrial Consumer .....	237
Hydro-system Capacity .....	238
Future Supply Options .....	238
Wind Power Potential.....	239
Additional Sensitivity Analyses .....	240
Downstream Impacts of Changes in Load and Price .....	242
Historical Without Basslink Baseline.....	246
Historical Record the Best Baseline.....	246
<b>Chapter 6</b>	
<b>NARRATIVES AND CONSTRUCTIONS .....</b>	<b>249</b>
ANALYSIS OF NARRATIVES .....	250
Narrative Certainty.....	250
Narratives and Concept Constructions as Argumentative Strategies.....	251
Constructions of the Model Outputs.....	251
Overstated Impacts .....	252
Load Constraints at the Gordon Power Station.....	252
Load Constraints Narrative .....	253
TEMSIM Model Bias Narrative.....	254
Mobilising Constructions .....	255
Contextualisation .....	257
A New 'Without Basslink' Baseline.....	260
TEMSIM-SYSOP Comparison .....	261
Revised Conclusions.....	261

Without Basslink (Historical) and Without Basslink (SYSOP) .....	262
Construction of Model Outputs as Further Understanding .....	263
A Matter of Scale .....	263
Hydrological Variability .....	264
A New Brief.....	264
Updating the Science .....	265
Moving the Boundaries .....	267
Constructions of the Gordon River.....	271
Juxtaposing Existing with Future Impacts .....	272
Ecological Management Based on Trade-Offs .....	273
Construction of the River as Not Having Reached Equilibrium.....	274
Diminishing the Value of the River .....	275
What's on the River? .....	276
Conflating the Equilibrium Construction with the River Narrative.....	277
Conflating the Equilibrium Construction with the Load Constraints Narrative...	278
Riparian Vegetation Loss .....	283
LEGITIMATION OF 'REALITIES' .....	285
Load Constraints Narrative .....	285
TEMSIM Model Bias Narrative.....	286
What is Reasonable? .....	288
Gordon River Narrative .....	288
Environmental Protection (Impact of Proposals) Act 1974 .....	289
World Heritage Properties Conservation Act 1983 .....	291
Precautionary Principle .....	295
<b>Chapter 7</b>	
<b>CHARTING THE MOBILITY OF 'NO NET BASSLINK IMPACT' .....</b>	<b>298</b>
'NO NET BASSLINK IMPACT': A USEFUL DISCURSIVE DEVICE .....	299
Origin and Definition .....	299
Tasmanian Wilderness World Heritage Area .....	300
Hydro Tasmania's Case 1.....	302
A Different Reading of the Load Constraints Narrative?.....	303
Hydro Tasmania's Case 2.....	304
Legal Case Linchpin.....	304
'Done to Death' River .....	305
'No Net Basslink Impact' Boundaries .....	307
Defining 'Long-Term Presently Occurring Trends' .....	308
Translocating Evaluation into the Future .....	311
Evidencing the Inapplicability of World Heritage Convention Legislation.....	312
Evidencing Compliance with the Tasmania Wilderness World Heritage Management Plan 1999 .....	315
Evidencing Sustainable Development .....	318
Evidencing an Application of the Precautionary Principle.....	318
REGULATORY OUTCOMES AND INSTRUMENTS.....	320
Monitoring, Reporting and Disclosure .....	321
JAP's Rejection of 'No Net Basslink Impact' .....	324
Management Restricted by 'No Net Basslink Impact' Limits.....	327
Trade-Offs .....	328
Disclosure and Compensation .....	329

## **Chapter 8**

### **THE CRITICS:**

<b>IGNORANT ILLITERATES OR PERCEPTIVE RECALCITRANTS? .....</b>	<b>332</b>
Drawing the Boundaries.....	334
Process Inequity .....	334
Raising Scientific Literacy .....	336
Reframing Indeterminacy as Uncertainty .....	338
Changing Contexts and Deepening Conditionality .....	340
Certainty Trough .....	340
Embedding Worldviews.....	342
Closed 'Black Boxes' .....	343
Loss of Agency .....	343
Issues of Dependency .....	345
Scepticism .....	345
Disbelief .....	346
Unintended Costs and Consequences .....	347
Trust and Suspended Doubt.....	348
The Past Informs the Future.....	350
A Loss of Social Identity .....	351
Inside the 'Black Box' .....	352
Challenging Proponents' Claims.....	352

<b>Chapter 9</b>	
LINKING NARRATIVES WITH THEORY .....	<b>357</b>
Epistemology and Ontology .....	358
Boundary-Work .....	359
Predictive Models .....	363
Can the 'Facts' Speak for Themselves? .....	364
Shedding Modalities .....	366
Prescriptive Social Framings and Worldviews .....	367
Contextual Factors .....	370
Co-construction .....	373
Fiducial Science .....	376
Certainty Trough .....	378
The Role of Narratives and Constructions .....	381
Indeterminacy .....	382
Multiple Constructions, Same Narrative .....	383
Validating Stories .....	384
Interpretative Repertoires .....	385
No Net Basslink Impact .....	386
Intermingled Discourses .....	387
<b>Chapter 10</b>	
CONCLUSIONS .....	<b>389</b>
<b>REFERENCES .....</b>	<b>403</b>
<b>APPENDICES .....</b>	<b>427</b>
APPENDIX 1-1 .....	428
APPENDIX 1-2 .....	428
APPENDIX 2 .....	431
APPENDIX 3 .....	433
APPENDIX 4-1 .....	434
APPENDIX 4-2 .....	437
APPENDIX 4-3 .....	439
APPENDIX 4-4 .....	441
APPENDIX 4-5 .....	443
APPENDIX 5 .....	446
APPENDIX 6 .....	448
APPENDIX 7 .....	449

## FIGURES

Figure 3.1 The Uncertainty Trough.....	129
Figure 5.1 PROPHET Data Sources.....	198

## GLOSSARY OF TERMS

---

AEA	Australian EcoGeneration Association
AM	Adaptive Management
ANT	Actor Network Theory
BCSE	Business Council for Sustainable Energy
BDB	Basslink Development Board
BPL	Basslink Pty Limited
CAAP	Combined Approvals and Assessment Process
COAG	Council of Australian Governments
CREA	Centre for Regional Economic Analysis
CSIRO	Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation
DIIAS	Draft Integrated Impact Assessment Statement
DPIWE	Department of Primary Industries, Water and Environment (an agency of the Tasmanian State government).
ECITA	Environment, Communications, Information Technology and the Arts Senate Committee
EIA	Environmental Impact Assessment
EIS	Environmental Impact Statement
EPBC Act	<i>Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999</i> (Commonwealth legislation).
EMPC Act	<i>Environmental Management and Pollution Control Act 1994</i> (Tasmanian legislation).
EPA	Environment Protection Agency
EPIP Act	<i>Environment Protection (Impact of Proposals) Act 1974</i> (Commonwealth legislation).
GCM	Global Circulation Models
HEC	Hydro-Electric Corporation
HECEC	Hydro-Electric Commission Enterprises Corporation
HT	Hydro Tasmania

HVDC	High Voltage Direct Current
IES	Intelligent Energy Systems
IIAS	Integrated Impact Assessment Statement
JKMRC	Julius Kruttschnitt Mineral Research Centre
JAP	Joint Advisory Panel
LWM	Low Water Mark
MW	Megawatt (= 1,000 kilowatts of electricity generation)
MWh	Megawatt hour (use of 1,000 kilowatts of electricity per hour)
MRET	Mandatory Renewable Energy Target
NCP	National Competition Policy
NEM	National Electricity Market
NEMMCO	National Electricity Market Management Company
NGIL	National Grid International Limited
NGG	National Grid Group
NGMC	National Grid Management Council
NIEIR	National Institute of Economic and Industry Research
ORER	Office of Renewable Energy Regulator
PMSEIC	Prime Minister's Science, Engineering and Innovation Council
POSS	Project of State Significance
REC	Renewable Energy Certificate
RGP	Real Gross Product
RMPS	Resource Management and Planning System (Tasmanian legislation)
RPDC	Resource Planning and Development Commission
SAFMA	<i>State Authorities Financial Management Act 1990</i>
SECV	State Electricity Commission of Victoria
SOEB	State Owned Energy Businesses
SOO	Statement of Opportunities (issued annually by NEMMCO)
SP&P Act	<i>State Policies and Projects Act 1993</i> (Tasmanian legislation)
SRMC	Short Run Marginal Cost
STS	Science and Technology Studies
SYSOP	SYStems OPeration model
TCCI	Tasmanian Chamber of Commerce and Industry
TEMSIM	Tasmanian Electricity Market Simulation Model



TFIC	Tasmanian Fishing Industry Council
TNGP	Tasmanian Natural Gas Project
TWWHA	Tasmanian Wilderness World Heritage Area
TWWHMP	Tasmanian Wilderness World Heritage Management Plan
VPX	Victorian Power Exchange
WHA	World Heritage Area
WHPC Act	<i>World Heritage Properties Conservation Act 1983</i>